

## Metaphorical Creativity in the Conceptualization of the Heart in Al-Ghazali's *The Revival of the Religious Sciences (Iḥyā' 'ulūm ad-dīn)*

Afef Badri  
University of Sfax, Tunisia

### Abstract

Zoltán Kövecses introduced the notion of “context-induced creativity” that he argues that it “has not so far been systematically explored in the cognitive linguistic literature on the metaphor”. Research on the conceptual metaphor of the heart has lacked focus on exploring creativity in the metaphorical expressions utilized to conceptualize the heart. Also, there is very limited research on the heart metaphor in religious and particularly Sufi discourse. To my knowledge, only Nørager (2007) and Maalej (2008) have explored this area. The present paper applies a conceptual metaphor paradigm with special reference to Kövecses' (2015) model of metaphorical creativity to study creativity in the conceptualization of the heart in Al-Ghazali's *The Revival of the Religious Sciences*. Corpus analysis has indicated that the novelty and creativity of heart metaphors are induced by a range of contextual variables: (1) the immediate physical setting, (2) knowledge about the major participants in the discourse, (3) the immediate cultural context, (4) the immediate social setting, and (5) the immediate linguistic context and that creativity is dependent on available conventional conceptual resources.

**Keywords:** conceptual metaphor, Sufi discourse, context, metaphorical creativity.

## **Introduction**

The introduction includes three parts a background of the research, a review of the literature, and a methodology section.

## **Background**

An early version of conceptual metaphor theory (Johnson and Lakoff, 2003) has neglected context in the study of metaphor. Later development of the theory has oriented the focus toward studying metaphor in discourse. This tendency assigned much importance to the contextual dimension in the production and comprehension of metaphors that started to be viewed as “products of context” (Gibbs and Lonergan, 2009, p. 251). Not only does context attune conventional metaphors to the discursive situation but it also triggers the creation of entirely novel metaphors. This type of metaphorical creativity is labeled “context-induced creativity”. Kövecses (2015) suggests that the role of context in generating creative metaphors has not been systematically explored. Metaphorical creativity itself apart from Kövecses (2010 and 2015) has received little focus (brief discussion in Gibbs, 1994, Lakoff and Turner, 1989, and Lakoff and Johnson, 1999).

Works that studied the metaphorical conceptualization of the heart (Yu, 2009, Nørager, 2007, Blechman, 2005, Siahaan, 2008, Swan, 2009, and Gutiérrez Pérez, 2008) have not paid much attention to the context except for Blechman (2005) who studied the portrayal of the heart in Western culture and investigated the implications of its persistence in contemporary public discourse and media products. (Yu, 2009) also studied « the cultural conception of the mental heart » in a cultural and historical context of ancient Chinese philosophy and medicine and modern Chinese language and discourse with a cross-cultural comparison of Chinese with western (English) conception of the heart focusing on uncovering cultural models underlying conceptualizations. And also Yu analyzed a Chinese essay entitled “On the ‘Heart’ for the New Year” Focusing on the conceptions of “heart” that make the Chinese cultural models for morality. He studied the role of underlying conceptual metaphors and metonymies in creating textual coherence.

Furthermore, there is very limited research on the heart metaphor in religious and particularly Sufi discourse. Nørager (2007) studied the functions of particular religious metaphors in the religious experience from a psychological point of view and Maalej (2008) studied cultural embodiment in the conceptualization of heart metaphor in Tunisian Arabic culture comparing it with the Western conceptualization of the mind. As for metaphorical creativity in the conceptualization of the heart and the role of the immediate context in influencing this creativity, none of the above-mentioned studies has explored the issue of creativity and to my knowledge, no research has done this.

The present paper studies the metaphorical conceptualization of the heart in Al-Ghazali’s *The Revival of the Sciences of Religious (Ihyā’ ulūm ad-dīn)* focusing on analyzing creative and novel instances. The major goal is to investigate the role of the immediate social, cultural, physical and linguistic context in the production of unique novel and creative heart

metaphors and to study the role of established conventional metaphors in sustaining novel mappings.

### **Review of the literature**

The literature review part presents conceptual metaphor theory, metaphorical creativity, and the contextual variables affecting creativity

### **Conceptual metaphor theory**

Conceptual metaphor is defined as a set of a fixed patterns of ontological correspondences across conceptual domains. Knowledge about conceptual domains and inferences are projected systematically from source to target. It consists in understanding and conceptualizing one domain of experience in terms of another domain of experience (Lakoff and Johnson, 2003, p. 6).

Contrary to traditional views where metaphor was assigned a peripheral status in the study of language and considered an ornamental linguistic device characterizing extraordinary aspects of language use such as poetic creativity and elevated styles, the cognitive approach advocates the centrality of metaphor to the process of meaning construction and understanding and to the conceptual system. Metaphorical reasoning pervades not just the language (in ordinary as equal as in poetic language) but in thought and actions as well. “We have found that our ordinary conceptual system, in terms of which we both think and act, is fundamentally metaphorical in nature” (Lakoff and Johnson, 1980, p. 4).

The metaphor LOVE IS A JOURNEY disconfirms the claim that views metaphor as an aspect of language. The different expressions about love such as “our relationship has hit a dead-end street”, “our relationship is spinning its wheels”, “we’re going in different directions”, “our relationship is at a cross-road” do not represent different, distinct and unrelated metaphors. They are rather different instantiations of the same conceptual metaphor LOVE IS A JOURNEY. Thus linguistic realizations of metaphor are manifestations of and evidence for the existence of metaphorical reasoning. Cross-domains mappings support the primacy of metaphorical reasoning over the linguistic realization (Lakoff and Johnson, 1999, p. 116).

### **Metaphor and context**

The failure of an early version of conceptual metaphor theory (Lakoff and Johnson, 1978, 1990, and 1998, Lakoff, 1992, Johnson, 1989, and Lakoff and Turner 1989) to recognize the crucial importance of context in metaphorical conceptualization has led to the emergence of an extensive literature that has studied metaphor in discourse (Kövecses, 2010, Charteris-Black, 2004, Masci and Semino, 1996, Cameron and Deignan, 2003, Musolff, 2004, Kövecses, 2010, Chilton, 2005, Musolff and Zinken, 2009, Hellsten, Nerlich and Zinken, 2008, Gibbs, and Cameron, 2007, Musolff, 2006, Cameron et al, 2009, Cameron, 2007, Cameron and Deignan, 2006, Cameron and Gibbs, 2008, Kövecses, 2015, Semino, 2008,

Zinken, 2007, Maalej, 2007, Brandt and Brandt, 2005, Steen, 1999, and 2011, and Gibbs and Lonergan, 2009).

These studies advocate the centrality of context. Metaphors are not decontextualized by contrast they are “products of discourse” (Gibbs and Lonergan, 2009, p. 251) and tightly associated with it. As a supportive argument for the claim that context plays a crucial role in metaphorical conceptualization Kövecses (2015, p. 9) presented the following conversation illustrating contextualized metaphorical usage:

- (1) “You seem much happier than the last time I saw you. You used to be discontented and easily distracted, but now you seem to be contented and at peace with yourself.”  
“My wife is an *anchor*.”
- (2) “You sound like you’ve become bored with life. You used to be so eager for new experiences, but now the old zest for life seems to have become dulled.”  
“My wife is an *anchor*” (Kövecses, 2015, p. 7).

In conceptualizing his life, emotional state, and relationship with his wife the speaker employed a metaphorical expression “My wife is an anchor” that combines three metaphors: LIFE IS A JOURNEY (goal, directions, destination, progress, losing direction...), HUMAN RELATIONS ARE PHYSICAL CONNECTIONS (bond, attachment, breaking connection...) and EMOTIONAL STABILITY/ STRENGTH IS PHYSICAL STABILITY/ STRENGTH (support, depend on, rely on, sustain). The lexical term “anchor” matches LIFE IS A JOURNEY metaphor because an anchor is a device utilized in sea journeys, it also matches HUMAN RELATIONS ARE PHYSICAL CONNECTIONS metaphor as it is attached physically to ships and it corresponds to the metaphor EMOTIONAL STABILITY/STRENGTH IS PHYSICAL STABILITY/STRENGTH as it is a device prototypically employed to keep a ship from moving away from a safe location. In the second part of the conversation the speaker employs the same expression “my wife is an anchor” to conceptualize difficulties that emerged in his relationship with his wife particularly concerning achieving life goals. The metaphorical expression in this context keeps the two metaphors LIFE IS A JOURNEY and HUMAN RELATIONSHIPS ARE PHYSICAL CONNECTIONS but it replaces the EMOTIONAL STABILITY/STRENGTH IS PHYSICAL STABILITY/STRENGTH metaphor by the metaphor LACK OF FREEDOM TO ACT IS LACK OF FREEDOM TO MOVE. This last metaphor still pertains to LIFE IS JOURNEY metaphors but it brings in focus a novel aspect of the speaker’s relationship with his wife namely his attitudes toward her as an impediment to motion and to attaining life goals. Thus the context generated two interpretations to the same metaphorical expression “anchor” emotional stability as opposed to lack of freedom of action.

### Metaphorical creativity

(Lakoff and Turner, 1989 p. 70-71) studied creativity in poetic metaphor. They maintained that poetic language depends on the same metaphorical mechanism available to ordinary people. Creativity is attained via three processes of extension, elaboration and combination or questioning of the available conventional metaphorical mapping. They viewed innovative metaphors as supporting evidence for the existence of established conceptual

mappings as creative metaphors depend on the extension of conventional metaphors. They argued that metaphorical mapping operates under strong constraints that permit only certain features of the source domain to be projected. The strength of human imagination and creativity cannot override these constraints. It can only extend and elaborate existing mappings within established conventional metaphors in novel and infinite ways (Lakoff and Turner, 1989, p. 26). Gibbs (1994, p. 7) also views that poetic and creative metaphors represent innovative instantiations of conventional mappings. For example Horace's conceptualization of death as the "eternal exile of the raft" elaborates both the kind of journey and the way of travelling in THE DEATH AS A DEPARTURE metaphor. Raft is an unusual way of travelling that takes human despite their will the same way as exile is an undesired and forced state (Lakoff and Turner, 1989, p. 68-67).

The aforementioned literature has studied only limited decontextualized examples of metaphorical creativity. It did not investigate the phenomenon in a systematic way nor did it explore the role of context in generating innovative metaphors.

### **Context-Induced Creativity**

Kövecses (2015 and 2010) elaborately studied what he calls "context-induced creativity" and "Context-induced metaphors" that are the products of the context. They do not emerge from any basic bodily experience or any correlation of experience (Kövecses, 2015, p. 116). Creativity consists in utilizing unused conceptual materials from the source to structure the target domain. A case in point is the metaphor EUROPE IS A BUILDING WITHOUT FIRE-EXIT where fire-exit is a conceptual element that pertains to the source domain of building and that has not been used previously (Kövecses, 2015, p. 99). Lakoff and Turner (1989, p. 64-65) suggested various ways that are utilized to generate creative metaphors among them are extending and elaborating. First, since metaphorical mapping is necessarily partial in the sense that it does not project every detail feature of the source domain, poets can search for unmapped details or slots to make novel inferences. This is called extending. The second process consists in the "nonconventional elaborating of schemas by filling in the slots in a creative and imaginative manner that adds new conceptual content.

Kövecses (2015, p. 102) classified the range of contextual variables that induce metaphorical creativity into 5 major factors (1) the effect of immediate physical setting, (2) the effect of knowledge about the major participants in the discourse, (3) the effect of the immediate cultural context, (4) the effect of the immediate social setting, and (5) the effect of the immediate linguistic context itself

### **The effect of knowledge about major entities in the discourse on metaphor use**

The effect of knowledge about major entities participating in the discourse is related to knowledge about the discourse participants and the influence of personal concerns and interests in metaphorical choices.

### **The effect of the immediate cultural context on metaphor use**

The salience of some concepts and values in a particular culture makes them more prominent than others in metaphorical conceptualization (Kövecses, 2015, p. 101).

### **The effect of the immediate social setting on metaphor use**

Society may be characterized by certain traits and may have particular concerns and interests.

### **The effect of the linguistic context (co-text)**

The effect of the surrounding discourse involves knowledge about the linguistic context (the cotext) of preceding discourse units. Previous discourse on the same topic may provide a source for creative metaphors. Former metaphors in previous discourse concerning the same topic may be exploited in a variety of ways; elaborating, extending, questioning; negating, reflecting on, ridiculing, and taking advantage of (Kövecses, 2015, p. 181). To illustrate the effect of this type of context Kövecses (2010, p. 293) cited the example of a headline from the *Wall Street Journal Europe* (January 6, 2003): “The Americanization of Japan’s car industry shifts into higher gear”. This headline exemplifies the effect of the linguistic context in producing novel metaphors. “Shift into higher gear” is driven from the domain of the car industry to convey the increased speed characterizing the process of Americanizing Japanese cars.

### **The Combined Effect of Factors on Metaphor Use**

The aforementioned factors can be conjoined together and the conceptualizer seeks to be coherent with the multi-aspects of every communicative situation. This is called “the combined effect of factors” (Kövecses, 2015, p. 113).

### **Methodology**

Relying on Kövecses’ (2015) model of context-induced metaphorical creativity this paper analyzes metaphorical conceptualization in Al-Ghazali’s *The Revival of the Religious Sciences (Ihyā’ ulūm ad-dīn)*. The book was written by Al-Ghazali (1058-1111). It reflects on religion (faith, worship, religious knowledge, morality, etc) from a Sufi perspective. It has been considered amongst the most read and most influential works in Islamic and particularly Sufi literature. Al-Zabidi (1311H) states: “were the books of Islam all to be lost, excepting only the *Ihyā’*, it would suffice to replace them all”. Imam Nawawi (606) stated that “*ihyā’* was about to be a Qur’ān” (the most read work in the Muslim world, after the Qur’ān). The choice of the book is completely random. I read the book a year ago (2014) and when I reviewed literature about the conceptual metaphor of the heart and metaphorical creativity I retained that in the *Ihya’* there are a lot of metaphors of the heart among them many creative ones and I decided that it could be a topic of research. The paper analyzed the entire book available on Al-Ghazali’s website. Metaphors are compiled and displayed in a tabular format.

Only metaphors deemed creative and innovative are analyzed. The analysis took into consideration the five major variables of metaphorical creativity notably; (1) the effect of the immediate physical setting, (2) the effect of knowledge about the major participants in the discourse, (3) the effect of the immediate cultural context, (4) the effect of the immediate social setting, and (5) the effect of the immediate linguistic context.

To guarantee the accuracy and objectivity of analysis the study relied on MIP model of metaphor identification. It is based on four procedures. The first procedure consists of an entire reading of the text and establishing an understanding of the meaning. The second procedure concerns the division of the text/discourse into lexical units. The third procedure requires: a) establishing the meaning of each lexical unit in context by taking into account preceding and following units, b) determining if the lexical unit has a basic current-contemporary sense other than the one utilized in the current context. Basic sense tends to be concrete (related to the perception of the five senses), associated with the body's actions, more precise (opposed to vague), and historically older. (c) If the lexical unit has a more basic sense different from its meaning in the current context, the decision should be taken regarding whether the context meaning contrasts the basic meaning and whether it can be interpreted in light of it. Finally, the fourth procedure consists in marking the lexical unit as metaphorical after comparing its meaning with the basic meaning (Erlbaum Associates (Pragglejaz Group), 2009, p. 3).

### **Corpus analysis**

The analysis does not intend to be any kind of quantitative analysis. It is mainly qualitative. The purpose is not to count metaphors but it is to investigate originality and creativity in metaphorical usages and analyze contextual variables that facilitate the emergence of such metaphors. Krennmayr (2011, p. 175) suggests that some texts exhibit the abundant presence of conventional metaphorical language common to most language use but they do not contain especially striking metaphorical instances. These texts are not experienced as distinctively metaphoric.

The heart is a key and central concept in the Sufi discourse and experience. Inayat Khan (1999) maintains that "if anyone asks what Sufism is, what kind of religion is it, the answer is that Sufism is the religion of heart, the religion in which the thing of primary importance is to seek God in the heart of mankind". Frager explaining the significance of heart for Sufis, states that "The heart is a temple that has been placed by God in everyone, a temple that houses the Divine spark within us". "The journey to God takes place within the heart, and for centuries Sufis have been traveling deep within themselves, into the secret chamber of the heart where lover and Beloved share the ecstasy of union" (Vaughan-Lee, 2006).

The Sufi is someone who approaches the Divine Reality through the heart. The heart is an intelligence beyond the intellect, a knowing that operates at a subconscious level, and the only human faculty expansive enough to embrace the infinite qualities of the universe (Helminski, 2000).

Al-Ghazali (1058-1111H) employed the term “*qalb*” to refer both to the flesh organ and to the “subtle tenuous substance” that he calls *al-Latifah al-Ruhaniyah* (spiritual subtlety). This subtle substance connected to the physical heart is spiritual in nature and it is the substance by which the real essence of man is defined. It represents the locus of knowledge and intellection. It pertains to the realm of the sciences of mystical unveiling (*‘ulum al-mukaashafa*) and it represents the central concern of this science. It is also viewed by Al-Ghazali as a Divine matter that transcends the capacity of intelligence (*‘ukul*) and understandings (*afhem*) to perceive and discern its nature and essence.

One of the key aspects characterizing the mystic experience is its “ineffability” and “incommunicableness” as it constitutes “a new awareness of other levels of reality that are not accessible to normal consciousness” (James, 1902). It is especially an experience of highly abstract, vague, and inaccessible to the domain of perception. The Sufi experience represents typical Target domains that are “abstract, diffuse and lack clear delineation; as a result, they “cry out” for metaphorical conceptualization” (Kövecses, 2002, p. 20).

Cacciri (1998, p. 121) suggests that the chief function of conceptual metaphor is to “bridge” from abstract domains to perceptual experiential domains and to describe abstract ideas that are inexpressible by literal language. Given that the heart is a spiritual subtle substance that pertains to the unseen universe of spirits (*‘aalem al-malakut*) Al-Ghazali utilized several tangible examples to explain what he calls “the marvels of the heart”. He relied on a variety of conceptual metaphors that range from entrenched metaphors to highly creative metaphors.

Kövecses’s (2015) study of metaphorical creativity suggested that there are various degrees of creativity from highly creative to partially creative to entrenched and conventionalized metaphors but it did not set a method to judge the degree of creativity of metaphors. The present study relied on three criteria to judge metaphorical creativity. First as suggested in (Kövecses, 2015, p. 99) creativity consists in utilizing unused conceptual materials from the source to structure the target domain. So metaphors that contain the mapping of novel source elements that are not mapped in conventional metaphors are considered innovative. The second criterion is to elaborate conventionally mapped elements in an innovative way. The third criterion is the novelty of the source domain for examples some sources have never been used before to conceptualize the concept of heart (Kövecses, 2010 and 2015, Gibbs, 1994, and Lakoff and Turner, 1989). The verification of whether a source domain was utilized in the conceptualization of the heart or whether a source element is novel is done by considering (Lakoff, et al, 1992)’s master metaphor list and previous works cited in the introduction about the conceptualization of the heart.

Only conceptual metaphors that are deemed creative are compiled and analyzed but if all metaphors describing the heart are collected the number would be much bigger than what is found. Corpus analysis has yielded the following major conceptual metaphors:

THE HEART IS A MIRROR REFLECTING DIVINE KNOWLEDGE  
THE HEART IS A CONTAINER



THE HEART IS A MATERIAL  
THE HEART IS A RULING KING IN BODY KINGDOM  
THE HEART IS A BUILDING  
THE HEART IS A TRAVELER IN A SPIRITUAL JOURNEY  
THE HEART IS THE LOCUS OF INTELLECTION  
THE HEART IS A SOURCE OF LIGHT  
THE HEART IS A FIELD FOR GROWING GOOD AND EVIL

This section presents an in-depth analysis of five conceptual metaphors. Each metaphor exemplifies a type of context-induced creativity. The analysis central focus is to explain the way context motivates metaphorical creativity by investigating the factors that primed, induced, prompted, and facilitated the choice of certain source domains and certain source elements to be mapped onto the target.

### **The effect of the immediate physical setting on metaphor creativity**

The immediate physical context concerns physical events, properties of the physical environment, and perceptual aspects of the physical setting. The physical context may motivate the extension of an established conventional metaphor. This type of creativity is illustrated by the conceptual metaphor of THE HEART IS A TRAVELER IN A SPIRITUAL JOURNEY and THE BODY IS A VEHICLE FOR THE HEART

هذه اللطيفة هي الساعية الى قرب الرب لانها من امر الرب فمنه مصدرها و اليه مرجعها و اما البدن فمطيبتها التي  
تركبها و تسعى بواسطها فالبدن لها في طريق الله تعالى كالناقة للبدن في طريق  
الحج و كالأروية الخازنة للماء الذي يفتقر اليه البدن. (93)

This tenuous subtlety is (the part of the human being) that is in pursuit of attaining closeness to God because it is a Divine matter from which it originates and to which it returns. As for body, it is its vehicle (ride) that it mounts and through which it proceeds to its pursuit. The body for it is like a camel for a body in the path of pilgrimage and like a reservoir storing water needed for the body (my translation).

The conventional metaphor life is a journey discussed in (Johnson and Lakoff, 2003) is creatively elaborated by exploiting elements from the physical setting. The schema of a journey contains only a few components such as travelers, path, and initial and final locations. It can be elaborated by specifying which kind of a journey (land, sea, and air), types of vehicles, features of the trajectory, and other elements. Thus the schema provides a range of varied options for enriching the conceptualization and comprehension of the target domain. Schemas of journey can also be non-conventionally elaborated by filling in the slots in a creative and imaginative manner that adds new conceptual content (Lakoff and Turner, 1989, p. 64-65).

Arabs used to travel by camels and horses for different purposes (pilgrimage, trade, and war). Their journeys were long and take months and even more. In long travelling in desert they needed to carry with them provision (water and food supply). The journey in THE HEART IS A TRAVELLER IN A SPIRITUAL JOURNEY is an unconventional journey that contains unconventional elements and participants.

The traveller is the heart (a spiritual subtlety).

The vehicle is the body (a physical entity that has an intelligible existence)

The provision is the body (as source of life that provides the heart with necessary conditions of existence).

The path is different stages of worship.

The destination is God and the hereafter.

What is considered as most innovative in this metaphor is the type of the traveller. In LIFE IS A JOURNEY, LOVE IS A JOURNEY, and ARGUMENT IS A JOURNEY metaphors the travellers are human beings that have tangible physical existence. But in THE HEART IS A TRAVELLER IN A SPIRITUAL JOURNEY metaphor the element of traveller is imaginatively and creatively elaborated. It is a spiritual, vague, and ineffable subtlety that pertains to a realm of existence inaccessible to human perception riding an intelligible vehicle.

The second innovative aspect is the nature of the relationship between the vehicle and the traveller in THE BODY AS A VEHICLE FOR THE HEART. As a traveller cannot travel without a vehicle and a provision in desert and as the heart cannot have a life and an existence independent of the body, the body is considered as a vehicle needed not only to carry it but also to provide it with indispensable food and water provision to remain alive and proceed in his journey. In a context different than desert a traveller may still continue to exist even without his vehicle, but in a long and tough journey in physical setting like desert the vehicle is crucial for a traveller to survive as it supplies him with vital provision. Thus it is the effect of the immediate physical context of travelling in desert that motivated the choice of the kind of journey and specified the type of relationship between the traveller and the vehicle.

### **The effect of knowledge about major entities in the discourse on metaphor use**

The effect of knowledge about major entities participating in the discourse is related to the knowledge about the conceptualizer and the influence of personal concerns and interests in metaphorical choices.

HEARTS ARE CONTAINERS OF FLUIDS CAPABLE OF BEING MOVED/  
PROVOKED/ AGITATED BY SUFI SMAA'

فان القلوب و السرائر خزائن الاسرار... فلا يظهر من القلب عند التحريك الا ما يحويه كما لا يرشح الابناء الا بما  
فيه فالسماح للقلب محك صادق و معيار ناطق فلا يصل نفس السماع اليه الا و قد  
تحرك فيه ما هو الغالب عليه. (266)

Hearts and internal secret substances are cupboards of secrets... when a heart is moved, only what is contained in it appears the same as a vessel reveals only what is inside it. *Samaa'* is a truthful touchstone and a speaking criterion for the heart (to test the nature of the heart). When the breath of *samaa'* reaches it, it provokes the thing most dominating in it.

HEARTS ARE CONTAINERS is a conventional metaphor that innovatively exploited the conventional CONTAINER metaphor to create a novel metaphor. When Containers of fluids (bottles, vessels) are agitated their contained substances are moved. The motion of substances cannot be achieved without an external provocative factor. The hidden essence and

secrets preserved inside the hearts cannot be moved unless provoked by an external stimulus which is Sufi *samaa* that is equivalent to listening in Arabic (*samaa* is a kind of Sufi songs chanted with some kind of musical rhythm (encyclopedia of Britannica). The creativity of this metaphor is triggered by the personal concerns and interests of the conceptualizer. The conceptualizer is a Sufi who performs dancing on the rhythms of *samaa*. *Samaa* and dancing engender different states in the body and the soul. The body becomes agitated and manifests different kinds of involuntary motions. The physical experience of the dancing and the agitated body is recruited and mapped onto the abstract experience of the agitated essences and secrets of the heart. The state of the body reflects the state of the soul (the heart). When the heart as a container is touched and moved by *samaa* its contained substance also gets agitated and moved. The engendered state of the heart is determined by the nature of the contained substance so for example if the heart is filled with love for a human being *samaa* evokes passions and longing towards the beloved person and if the heart is filled only by love to God *samaa* evokes different emotions of yearning to God. Thus *samaa* is creatively conceptualized as a touchstone utilized to test the nature of the essence contained in the heart. This metaphor is also induced by the body experience as the body is also considered as a type of context triggering metaphorical creativity. What is most innovative is using the touchstone of *samaa* to test the essence contained in the heart by moving and agitating it. The agitation and movement are mapped from the state of the body although the state of the body is triggered by the state of the heart which is itself influenced and moved by *Samaa*.

### The effect of the immediate cultural context on metaphor use

The salience of some concepts and values in a particular culture makes them more prominent than other concepts and values in metaphorical conceptualization (Kövecses, 2015, p. 101).

(Al-Ghazali, vol 2, p. 266). فان القلوب و السرائر خزائن الاسرار و معادن الجواهر و قد طويت فيها جواهرها كما طويت النار في الحديد و الحجر... و لا سبيل الى استئثار خفاياها الا بقوادح السماع.  
Hearts and internal containers of secrets are cupboards of secrets and metals of essences. Their essences are hidden inside them the same way as fire is hidden inside iron and stones... there are no ways of provoking their secrets unless by the lighter triggers of *samaa* (my translation).

(Al-Ghazali, vol 2, p. 278). النار الجواهر المعروضة عليها من الخبث.  
And then those states become causes (engendering) subsequent states that burn the heart with their fire and cleanse it from impurities the same as when fire purifies essences exposed to it from impurities (my translation).

### HEARTS ARE METALS

The creativity of this metaphor is induced by cultural knowledge frames about materials (gold, silver, steel) and the use of fire to purify metals by removing unwanted impurities. HEARTS ARE METALS is a conventional conceptual metaphor but it is the projection of novel elements (not used before) from the source to structure the target that produces creativity. Hearts containing secrets and hidden essences are conceptualized as essences of materials hidden inside those materials. Essences of metals are obtained after being burned by fire to remove impurities. Fire is the touchstone to test the real essence of a metal. Similarly hearts are burned by the fire of *samaa* and the states resulting from *samaa* to reveal their

true essences. So *samaa* ' is a touchstone for proving the essences of hearts. If the heart is attached to material and lustful pleasures the fire of *samaa* ' will reveal this lustful essence of the heart (for example *samaa* ' evokes memories of a love experience). And if the heart is attached to spiritual pleasures (prayer, God remembrance, pilgrimage) *samaa* ' cannot evoke in it feelings other than the love of God and the desire to be with him the same as a piece of steel for example burned by fire cannot become another thing except a piece of steel.

### **The effect of the surrounding discourse and previous discourses on the same topic**

Surrounding discourse involves knowledge about the linguistic context (the cotext) of preceding discourse units. Previous discourse on the same topic may provide a source for creative metaphors. Former metaphors in previous discourse concerning the same topic may be exploited in a variety of ways; elaborating, extending, questioning; negating, reflecting on, ridiculing, and taking advantage of (Kövecses, 2015, p. 181).

### **THE HEART IS A MIRROR FOR REFLECTING DIVINE KNOWLEDGE**

(Al-Ghazali, vol 3, p. 8). فالقلب مثل المرأة والشهوة مثل الصداً و معاني القران مثل الصور تتراءى في المرأة

The heart is like a mirror and lust is like rust and the meanings of the Holy Qur'an are like images that appear in the mirror (my translation).

This metaphor was utilized creatively by extending and elaborating it in different manners. It is divided into a number of sub-metaphors:

**THE HEART IS A POLISHED MIRROR CAPABLE OF REFLECTING DIVINE KNOWLEDGE.**

**THE HEART IS A MIRROR TARNISHED BY LUST.**

**THE HEART IS A MIRROR THAT GETS TARNISHED BY THE ASCENDING SMOKE OF EVIL DEEDS.**

**SINFUL HEARTS ARE A MIRROR DARKENED BY BEING BREATHED UPON.**

**THE HEART IS A MIRROR COVERED BY A VEIL.**

**THE HEART IS A MIRROR REFLECTING THE IMAGE OF ANOTHER MIRROR.**

**THE HEART IS A MIRROR THAT REFLECTS KNOWLEDGE FROM THE PRESERVED TABLET.**

The metaphor of the mirror is the most prominent conceptualization of the heart prevailing in the corpus. It is utilized to conceptualize the heart's capacity to receive and reflect Divine knowledge concerning God, his attributes, and his deeds. The method of acquiring this type of knowledge is through direct revelation and mystical unveiling (*kashf/ mukaashafa*) that is achieved by purification of the heart to receive Divine illumination. The heart capacity to know is assembled to a mirror in different states. The inability of the mirror to reflect images is caused by five factors: the imperfection of the mirror itself, the rust tarnishing the face of the mirror, the mis-orientation of the mirror (it is not directed towards the desired objects to be reflected), the existence of a veil interfering between the mirror and the image, and finally the ignorance about the right direction from which the image of the object can be viewed.

The five elements of the source domain are creatively exploited to conceptualize the heart as a mirror capable of revealing and reflecting Devine knowledge. Before the age of puberty the heart is incomplete and lacks maturity to receive and reflect knowledge like a piece of material that is not polished. The dirt tarnishing the mirror is mapped onto passions and sins heaped up over the face of the heart. The misorientation of the mirror is mapped onto the heart wrong direction of being oriented towards following passions or worrying about peripheral life matters. The veil separating the mirror and the image is mapped onto dogmatic beliefs held by the heart (Blindly following dogmatic interpretations of theologians and fanatically following of schools (*madhahib*)). And finally the ignorance about the right direction is mapped onto the ignorance of the heart about the efficient methods of acquiring knowledge.

THE HEART IS A MIRROR metaphor employs the conventional metaphor KNOWLEDGE IS VISION in a very creative way to conceptualize the heart. Vision in this metaphor is not achieved directly. It is rather mediated by the mirror. The recruitment of the mirror as a medium for acquiring knowledge is triggered by states of cleanness and impurity of the heart resulting from sins and evil qualities and their opposites. These states match different conditions of the mirror (not polished, not cleansed, bright, and polished). The mirror is selected to serve the purpose of the target. It is a target-induced creativity. THE HEART IS A MIRROR METAPHOR is extended and elaborated by mapping each time novel elements from the source domain to create innovative conceptualizations. A tarnished mirror prevents the reflection of images in it is mapped to the rust of sins heaped up on the face of the heart preventing it from reflecting knowledge.

The mirror that is tarnished and then wiped off and tarnished and wiped off again has less clarity and brightness than an originally clear mirror that is polished to increase its shining and clarity. This element is utilized to describe varied levels and states of clarity of hearts. The heart that commits a sin and then follows the evil deed by a good deed has a far less clarity and brightness than a heart that did not have any rust of sins.

(Al-Ghazali) ومن أتبع السيئة الحسنة وما أثرها لم يظلم قلبه ولكن ينقص نوره كالمرأة التي يتنفس فيها ثم تمسح ويتنفس ثم تتمسح فإنها لا تخلو عن كدورة. (Al-Ghazali, vol 12, p. 93)

And that who follows an evil deed by a good deed and wipes out its trace his heart does not become dark but its shining is reduced the same as a mirror that is breathed upon and wiped out and breathed upon again and wiped out cannot be devoid from dimness (my translation).

(Al-Ghazali) فليست المرأة التي تتدنس ثم تمسح بالمصقلة كالتي تمسح بالمصقلة لزيادة جلائها من غير دنس سابق. (Al-Ghazali, vol 3, p. 12)

The mirror that is tarnished and then wiped out by the polish is not like the mirror that is polished to increase its clarity without being previously tarnished (my translation).

To conceptualize the gradual heaping up of the rust of passions and sins upon the face of the heart Al-Ghazali creatively utilized an innovative element induced and prompted by the purpose of the target.

(Al-Ghazali, وأما الأثار المذمومة فإنها مثل دخان مظلم يتصاعد إلى مرآة القلب ولا يزال يتراكم عليه مرة بعد أخرى إلى أن يسود ويظلم ويصير بالكليّة محجوبا عن الله تعالى وهو الطبع وهو الرين. (vol 3, p. 11).

As for blameworthy effects, they resemble a dark smoke that rises to the mirror of the heart and it keeps heaping over the face of the heart from time to time until the heart becomes black, dim, and entirely veiled from God. And that is the seal and the rust (my translation).

### THE HEART IS A MIRROR THAT GETS TARNISHED BY THE ASCENDING SMOKE OF EVIL DEEDS AND QUALITIES.

This type of creativity is called “target-induced creativity”. Darkening smoke gradually rises up over the mirror of the heart and is heaped up upon it time after time until it becomes black and clouded, and entirely veiled from Allah. The innovation of this metaphor is inspired by a previous discourse of the prophet about the gradual blackening of hearts by sins.

إن المؤمن إذا أذنب ذنبا كانت نكتة سوداء في قلبه ، فإن تاب ونزع واستغفر صقل منها قلبه ، وإن زاد زادت حتى يعلق بها قلبه فذلك الران الذي ذكر الله في كتابه : ( كلا بل ران على قلوبهم ما كانوا يكسبون

Whenever the servant commits a wrong, a black spot is put in his heart. So, if he refrains from it, seeks forgiveness and repents, his heart is polished clean. But if he returns to the sin, the spot will increase until it overcomes his (entire) heart, and this is the Ran that Allah mentions when He says: (Nay, but on their hearts is the Ran (covering) which they used to earn.) (Daily Hadith Online’s website).

### THE HEART IS A MIRROR REFLECTING IMAGES FROM ANOTHER MIRROR

Furthermore the above mentioned five hindrances are conceptualized as a veil placed between the mirror of heart and the mirror of the Preserved Tablet. The veil placed between a mirror and another mirror facing it is exploited creatively to describe the veil of the heart preventing it from receiving knowledge from the mirror of the Preserved Tablet. There are different ways of removing the veil between two mirrors; it can be drawn aside by man’s volition or by the blow of winds. These two ways are mapped to the veil of the heart. It can only be removed by purifying the heart from the stain and rust of sins and passions and then waiting for Divine winds of grace to lift it generating the direct unveiling.

وتجلى حقائق العلوم من مرآة اللوح في مرآة القلب يضاهي انطباع صورة من مرآة في مرآة تقابلها والحجاب بين المرأتين تارة يزال باليد وأخرى يزول بهبوب الرياح تحركه وكذلك قد تهب رياح الألفاظ وتتكشف الحجب عن أعين القلوب فينبجلي فيها بعض ما هو مسطور في اللوح المحفوظ. (18)

The revelation of the truth of knowledge from the mirror of the Preserved Tablet in the mirror of the heart resembles the impression of an image from a mirror to a mirror that faces it. The veil between the two mirrors sometimes is removed by the hand and sometimes is removed by the blow of winds that move it. Similarly the winds of grace may blow causing veils to be removed from the eyes of hearts and then some of what is written down in the Preserved Tablet is revealed in the hearts (my translation).

The removing of the veil results from the blow of the “Divine winds of grace”. The divine winds of grace that draw aside the veil placed between the heart and the mirror of the Preserved Tablet is induced by previous discourse from the Prophetic tradition about the same topic that Al-Ghazali kept mentioning all over his book:

(Al-Ghazali, vol 3, p. 8). إن لربكم في أيام دهركم نفحات، فتعرضوا لها لعله أن يصيبكم نفحة منها فلا تشقون بعدها أبدا  
Your Lord, in the days of your time, has gusts. Expose yourselves to them. Shall a gust from them reach you then you will never be miserable after that (may translation).

The removing of the veil by the blowing of the divine winds of grace is further innovatively exploited to yield another creative metaphor.

(Al-Ghazali, vol 3, p. 18). حتى يرتفع الحجاب بلطف خفي من الله تعالى فيلمع في القلوب من وراء ستر الغيب شيء من غرائب العلم تارة كالبرق الخاطف  
Until the veil is lifted by a hidden grace from Allah and then something from the peculiarities of knowledge shines in the heart from behind the curtain of the veiled world (*ghayb*) sometimes like the flashing of lightning (my translation).

The blow and the motion of wind are normally known to be beyond the control of man unpredictable, and arbitrary. This piece of knowledge is employed to describe the way and the amount of time of mystic unveiling and direct divine revelation. This is compared to flashes of dazzling lightning that last only for very short moment. The winds suddenly blow removing the veil so that the image (revelations) flashes in the mirror (the heart), and then the veil returns when the wind stops. Whenever the wind blows the veil is removed and the image flashes in the mirror. The flashing may be very brief and rare and it may be continuous and lasting long in time depending on the strength and the continuation of the blowing of wind. This is like the mystic unveiling upon which Sufis have no control.

### The effect of the immediate social context

Society may be characterized by certain traits and may have particular concerns and interests.

(Al-Ghazali, vol 1, p. 392). فما ينحل عن القلب من عقد حب الدنيا.

The number of knots of loving worldly life that are untangled from around the heart (my translation).

### THE LOVE OF WORLDLY LIFE IS KNOTS TYING THE HEART (BOUND OF SLAVERY)

LOVE IS A BOND metaphor (“There is a close *tie* between them”) discussed in (Kovecses, 2000, p. 26) is deployed in an unconventional manner to describe the heart attachment to the worldly life. The creativity is motivated by the then prevailing social norms of slavery and chains and bonds of slavery. What is innovative in the metaphor is that it

conceptualizes love for worldly life as tied knots that are untangled progressively and partially. Whenever a knot is untangled the heart attains a greater degree of freedom.

The aforementioned factors can be conjoined together and the conceptualizer seeks to be coherent with the multi-aspects of every context. This is called “the combined effect of factors” (Kövecses, 2015).

## **Discussion**

Corpus analysis has yielded three significant results:

First it has revealed that metaphors are “products of context” par excellence. Metaphoric creativity is grounded in the multiple aspects of the immediate context. Discursive, physical, social, and cultural context motivated metaphorical creativity by introducing factors that primed, induced, prompted and facilitated the choice of certain conceptual metaphors (Kövecses, 2015, p. 99). This provides a piece of evidence supporting the centrality of context in determining metaphorical choices and especially in inducing creativity.

A considerable portion of novel and unconventional metaphorical language seems to derive from such contextual factors as the immediate linguistic context, knowledge about discourse participants, physical setting, and the like. It remains to be seen how robust the phenomenon is and whether it deserves serious further investigation. Many of these metaphors are clearly not, in Grady’s (1999) classification, either resemblance or correlation based cases. They seem to have a unique status, in that they are grounded in the context in which metaphorical conceptualization is taking place (Kövecses, 2015, p. 114).

The investigation of metaphorical creativity in the corpus has proved that context played a crucial role in the production of creative metaphors that are innovative elaboration of conventional metaphors. This proves that context-induced metaphorical creativity has indeed a significant presence in the corpus which deserves investigation in future research.

The second result is that the physiological aspect of embodiment has no primacy over cultural, social, and physical, and discursive aspects emerging from the immediate context as claimed in the early formulation of conceptual metaphor theory (Johnson and Lakoff, 2003). The metaphors analyzed in the corpus are products of the context (especially local context). They do not emerge from any basic bodily experience or any correlation of experience.

The third result concerns the instantiation of conventional metaphorical mappings in novel metaphors. Basic conventional metaphors such as LIFE IS A JOURNEY are considered as “conceptual resources” equally available for both poets and ordinary people to make sense of their experience. The strength of human imagination and creativity cannot override the constraints of the established metaphors, it can only extend and elaborate conventional mappings in novel and infinite ways (Gibbs, 1994, p. 7 and Lakoff and Turner, 1989, p. 26). Many creative metaphors in the corpus depended on conventional mappings



such as LIFE IS A JOURNEY, KNOWLEDGE IS VISION, HEART IS A CONTAINER, and HEART IS A MATERIAL. These conventional mappings sustained novel mappings. The metaphors analyzed in the corpus even though innovative metaphors but they all depended on the instantiation and elaboration of conventional metaphorical mappings. The basic conceptual resources are limited but the ways of exploiting these resources are infinite. This is what Lakoff and Turner (1989, p. 65) called “the power of options” provided by conceptual metaphor. The extension of established metaphors to create novel ones is considered as a piece of evidence that supports the existence of conceptual metaphors (metaphor is not a matter of language) and the vividness of conventional metaphorical mappings. This evidence refutes the traditional claim about the existence of a type of metaphors called “dead metaphors”. What make metaphorical mapping alive is its functioning in an effortless and unconscious manner. This contrasts what is traditionally claimed that the vividness of a metaphor is derived from its conscious conceptualization (mappings are instantiated unconsciously) (Lakoff and Turner, 1989, p. 129).

The revival of the sciences of religion is characterized by a significant amount of conceptual creativity that marks it as metaphorically powerful type of Sufi discourse. De Landtsheer’s (2009) model of metaphor power suggested that metaphor intensity (MI) is measured by the “score of originality” of each metaphor. Intensity is attained by the novelty and creativity of metaphorical expressions. Innovative metaphors are considered more intense than conventional metaphors.

### **Implication of the study**

The findings of this research can be extended to investigate further aspects of the Sufi discourse as a discourse revolving around highly abstract and metaphysical issues. Future research may analyze larger corpora representing different works of various authors to see whether Sufis systematically utilize language and metaphors in an unconventional way, to what extent their creativity is constrained by conventional conceptual resources, and the degree of contextual influence in the creativity of their metaphors.

### **Conclusion**

To conclude it could be said that the conceptualization of the heart in Al-Ghazali the revival of the sciences of religion is marked by an important portion of creative and innovative conceptual metaphors. The creativity of metaphors was induced and facilitated by a range of contextual variables namely:

- Effect of the immediate linguistic context
- Effect of the immediate cultural context
- Effect of the immediate social context
- Effect of the immediate physical setting
- Effect of the personal concerns and interests of the conceptualizer

The findings proved that metaphorical creativity in the book is a significant phenomenon that context played a vital role in structuring this phenomenon, and that conventional mappings are vivid conceptual resources sustaining novel mappings.

### **Acknowledgment**

All praise and thanks go to Allah the Almighty, the extremely Merciful for helping me to accomplish this work. I am also deeply indebted to my supervisor Professor Mounir Triki for his unlimited kindness and support.

## References

- Al-Ghazali's website Al-Ghazali, A. Ihya' 'Ulum Ad-Deen. Available on (<http://ghazali.org/ihya/english/index.html>)
- Al-Zabidi, M.M. (1311H). *Ithaf al-sada al-muttaqin*.
- Arslan, F. (2014). A heart-based Sufi Mindfulness Spiritual Practice Employing Selfjourneying. Scholars Commons @ Laurier.
- Blechmen, R. (2005). The Heart of the Matter: An Exploration of the Persistence of Core Beliefs. Proceedings of the Media Ecology Association, Volume 6.
- Cameron, L., Maslen, R., Todd, Z., Maule, J., Stratton, P., and Stanley, N. (2009). The discourse dynamics approach to metaphor and metaphor-led discourse analysis. *Metaphor and Symbol*, 24(2) pp. 63–89.
- Cameron, L., & Deignan, A. (2006). The emergence of metaphor in discourse. *Applied Linguistics*, 27(4), 671–690.
- Cameron, L. (2003). *Metaphor in Educational Discourse*. London: Continuum.
- Cameron, L. (2007b). Patterns of metaphor use in reconciliation talk. *Discourse and Society*, 18: 197–222.
- Cameron, L. and Gibbs, R. (2008). Metaphor and talk. In Raymond Gibbs, ed., *The Cambridge Handbook of Metaphor and Thought*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Cameron, L. (2007). Confrontation or complementarity? Metaphor in language use and cognitive metaphor theory. *Annual Review of Cognitive Linguistics*. Vol. 5, No. 1, 107–135.
- Cameron, L. and Deignan, A. (2006). The emergence of metaphor in discourse. *Applied Linguistics* 27(4): 671–690.
- Cacciari C. (1998). *Why Do We Speak Metaphorically? Reflections on the Functions of Metaphor in Discourse and Reasoning*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Charteris-Black, Jonathan. (2004). *Corpus Approaches to Critical Metaphor Analysis*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Chilton, p. (2005). *Cold War Discourse from Containment to Common House*. New York, Bern, Berlin, Frankfurt/M., Paris.
- Conflict and Consciousness. Studies in War, Peace, and Social Thought. Vol. 2 General Editor: Charles Webel.

- Daily Hadith Online. Available on (<http://dailyhadith.abuaminaelias.com/2012/09/13/hadith-on-sin-when-a-muslim-commits-a-sin-a-black-spot-appears-on-his-heart-until-he-repents/>).
- Encyclopedia Britannica. Available on (<http://www.britannica.com/topic/sama-Sufi-religious-practice>).
- Frager, R. The Sufi Approach to Opening the Heart. Available on ([http://www.personaltransformation.com/robert\\_frager.html](http://www.personaltransformation.com/robert_frager.html)).
- Gutiérrez Pérez, R. (2008). A Cross-Cultural Analysis of Heart Metaphors. *Revista Alicantina de Estudios Ingleses* 21: 25-56
- Gibbs, R., & Lonergan, J. (2009). Studying metaphor in discourse: Some lessons, challenges, and new data. In A. Musolff & J. Zinken. (Eds.). *Metaphor in discourse*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Gibbs, R. (1994). *The Poetics of Mind. Figurative Thought, Language, and Understanding*. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Gibbs, R. and Cameron, L. (2007). Social-cognitive dynamics of metaphor performance. *Cognitive Systems Research*, 9: 64–75.
- Gibbs, R. and Cameron, L. (2008). The social-cognitive dynamics of metaphor performance. *Cognitive Systems Research* 9(1–2): 64–75.
- Grady, J. (1997a). *Foundations of Meaning: Primary Metaphors and Primary Scenes*. Ph.D. diss., Department of Linguistics, University of California at Berkeley.
- Grady, J. (1997b). Theories are building revisited. *Cognitive Linguistics*, 8: 267–290.
- Helminski, S. (2000). *The Knowing Heart: A Sufi Path of Transformation*. Publications Boston and London.
- Hellsten, L., Nerlich, B., and Zinken, J. (2008). Discourse metaphors. In cognitive linguistics research. Walter de Gruyter.
- James, W. (2002). *The Varieties of Religious Experience A Study in Human Nature*. Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University.
- Lakoff, G. and Johnson, M. (2003). *Metaphors We Live By*. New edition with Afterword. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Jonhson, M. and Lakoff, G. (1999). *Philosophy in the Flesh: The Embodied Mind and its Challenge to Western Thought*. New York. Basic Books.

- Johnson, M. (1987). *The Body in the Mind: The Bodily Basis of Meaning, Imagination, and Reason*. Chicago: University of Chicago.
- Johnson, M. (1987). *The Body in the Mind: The Bodily Basis of Meaning, Imagination, and Reason*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Khan, I. (1999). *The Soul's Journey*. Omega Publications, Incorporated.
- Kövecses, Z. (2010b). A new look at metaphorical creativity in cognitive linguistics.
- Kövecses, Z. (2010a). *Metaphor: A Practical Introduction*. Second edition. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press. *Cognitive Linguistics*, 21(4): 663–697.
- Kövecses, Z. (2015). *Where Metaphors Come from Reconsidering Context in Metaphor*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Kövecses, Z. (2000). *Metaphor and Emotion Language, Culture, and Body in Human Feeling*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Krennmayr, T. (2011). *Metaphor in newspapers*. LOT Dissertation Series, 276. Utrecht: LOT
- Lakoff, George. (1987). *Women, Fire, and Dangerous Things: What Categories Reveal About the Mind*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Lakoff, George and Mark Johnson. (1980). *Metaphors We Live By*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Lakoff, G. and Turner, M. (1989). *More Than Cool Reason: A Field Guide to Poetic Metaphor*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Lakoff, G. (1992). *The Contemporary Theory of Metaphor. Metaphor and Thought* (2nd edition). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lakoff, G., Espenson, J., and Schwartz, A. (1991). *Master Metaphor List*. Second Edition. California: University of California at Berkeley.
- Maalej, Z. (2008). The heart and cultural embodiment in Tunisian Arabic. In Farzad Sharifian, René Dirven, Ning Yu and Susanne Nie-meier (eds.), 395-429.
- Maalej, Z. (2007). Doing critical discourse analysis with the contemporary theory of metaphor: towards a discourse model of metaphor. *Cognitive Linguistics in Critical Discourse Analysis: Application and Theory*. Edited by Christopher Hart and Dominik Lukeš. Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Masci, M. and Semino, E. (1996). Politics is Football: Metaphor in the Discourse of Silvio Berlusconi in Italy. *Discourse & Society*, 1996 - [das.sagepub.com](http://das.sagepub.com)

- Musolff, A. (2004). *Metaphor and Political Discourse: Analogical Reasoning in Debates about Europe*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Musolff, A. and Zinken, J. (2009). *Metaphor and Discourse*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Musolff, A. (2006). Metaphor scenarios in public discourse. *Metaphor and Symbol* 21(1): 23–38. Imam Nawawi (606).
- Niemeier, S. What's in a heart? Culture-specific concepts of emotionality and rationality. Available on (<http://www.cognitive-sciences.de/docs/all.abstracts/Niemeier.pdf>).
- Nørager, T. (2007). (2nd ed. with divergent page numbering) Linguistic Agency Series A University of Duisburg-Essen.
- Nerlich, B. (2007). Media, metaphors and modelling: How the UK newspapers reported the epidemiological modelling controversy during the 2001 foot and mouth outbreak. *Science, Technology & Human Values*, 32(4): 432–457.
- Pragglejaz Group. (2007). MIP: A method for identifying metaphorically used words in discourse. *Metaphor and Symbol*, 22(1): 1–39.
- Swan, T. (2009). Metaphors of Body and Mind in the History of English. *English Studies* Vol. 90, No. 4, 460–475.
- Siahaan, P. (2008). Did he break your *heart* or your *liver*? A contrastive study on metaphorical concepts from the source domain ORGAN in English and in Indonesian. In Farzad Sharifian, René Dirven, Ning Yu and Susanne Niemeier (eds.), 133-170.
- Semino, E. 2008. *Metaphor in Discourse*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Steen, G. 1999. From linguistic to conceptual metaphor in five steps. In R. Gibbs and G. Steen (eds.), *Metaphor in Cognitive Linguistics*, 57–77. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Steen, Gerard. (2011). The contemporary theory of metaphor—now new and improved! *Review of Cognitive Linguistics*, 9–1: 26–64.
- Vaughan-Lee, L. (2006) The Sufi Meditation of the Heart. Available on ([http://www.goldensufi.org/a\\_meditation\\_of\\_heart.html](http://www.goldensufi.org/a_meditation_of_heart.html)).
- Yu, N. (2009). *The Chinese heart in a Cognitive Perspective: Culture, Body, and Language*. Walter de Gruyter GmbH & Co. KG, D-10785 Berlin.
- Zinken, J. 2007. Discourse metaphors: The link between figurative language and habitual analogies. *Cognitive Linguistics* 18(3): 445–466.